PERSPECTIVES FROM PAKISTAN: AFTER THE TRANSPLANT LAW; WHAT NEXT?

Aamir Jafarey
Centre of Biomedical Ethics and Culture,
SIUT, Pakistan
Outline

- Background
- The law
- The deceased donor drive
- The study
- Conclusions
- The way forward
Pakistan: Living donor kidney transplantation

The Changing Face of Renal Transplantation

Slide courtesy Dr. Anwar Naqvi, SIUT

Private centres increased from 8 to 16

Related
Unrelated
Transplant Ordinance – 2007: Salient Features

- Living person may donate who is close blood relative & spouse and approved by Evaluation Committee (EC)
- In case of non availability, approval by EC is mandatory
- Living person may authorize donation after brain death
- Evaluation Committee shall consists of a team of transplant specialists and two local notable from Civil Society
- Establishment of a National Registry for evaluating quality and outcome of transplants in authorized centers
- The government will help indigent patients with post transplant care and all donors are to be followed up
- Donation by Pakistani citizens shall not be permissible to citizens of other countries.
Attempt to ‘deface’ the Ordinance

- Amendments in ordinance:
  - Proposed to allow compensation in case of non-related donation
  - Proposed to allow unrelated donors in the event of threat to life
  - Proposed removal of prohibition for transplant of foreigners and suggested a quota

**Result:** Withdrawn unanimously on 3rd January 2009
Further Attempt: Sharia Court Petition: Ordinance is repugnant to Quran and Sunnah”

- Section 3(1): **Bars the non-close blood relative to donate** an organ to save the life of a Muslim brother
- Section 5: Constitution and jurisdictions of Evaluation Committee **was challenged on the pretext of delay**
- Section 7(1): **Banning the foreigners (e.g. from Muslim countries) is against the Islam** and was discriminatory

**Verdict:** Transplant ordinance not repugnant to Quran & Sunnah.
Sale of organ is un-Islamic.
Deceased donor drive

- Large public event at SIUT
- Over 250 deceased donor cards filled
- Prevailing concepts among potential donors:
  - Organs to be retrieved after soyem
  - Ambiguity about who qualifies as a donor and who does not
  - Uncertainty about how to initiate the donation process after death
Deceased donor drive

- Among the medical community:
  - Unclear about “types of death”
  - Lack of concepts about who qualifies as a donor
  - No mechanisms for initiating the process
  - Fear of annoying the distressed family
The study

- Target population: cross section of Karachiites
- The tool: open ended, interviewer led questionnaire
- Four investigators
- Combined data analysis
Results

- N=119
- Lay public: 81%
- Equal gender distribution
- Age under 50 years: 90%
Literacy

- Illiterate: 19%
- Class 5 or less: 4%
- Class 6-9: 14%
- Class 10: 25%
- Up to class 12: 11%
- Graduate: 19%
- Postgraduate: 5%
- Madrassa education: 3%
Religion

- Islam: 88%
- Christian: 10%
- Hindu: 2%
Awareness of organ transplant law

- Yes, there is one: 12%
- No, there is none: 21%
- Don’t know: 58%
Focus

- Respondents' information regarding religious position on organ donation
  - Living donations
  - Deceased donations

- Concepts about consent for deceased donation
Living donations

- Knowledge about religious position:
  - 71% were ignorant or had incorrect information
    - 86% in this group felt it would be permissible

“Mairee apnee soch hay kay Islam dusron kay kaam anay ko kahta hay”

“Aql kahtee hay kay kisee ka fayada ho ga, deen iss kee ijazat zaroor day ga”
Deceased donations

- Knowledge about religious position:
  - 89% were ignorant or had incorrect information
    - 45% in this group felt it would be permissible

“Kisee kee zindagi bach rahee hay. Islam zaroor ijazat day ga”

“Jims Allah kee amanat hay is leay is kee ijazat nahee ho gee”

“Gunah hay. Murday ko takleef ho gee”
Consent issues

- Is the deceased persons prior permission necessary?
  - Yes: 83%
- Is additional consent needed from family?
  - Yes: 62%

"Marnay kay baad khandaan ka farz hay kay mayay huay kay leay sochay"

"Zaroorey hay takay baad main confusion na ho"
Conclusions

- After controlling organ trade, developing a deceased donor program is essential.
- Prevailing concepts about religious opinions regarding deceased organ donation are skewed.
- There is an emphasis on the inclusion of family members in the decision to donate.
Recommendations

- Public opinion needs to be molded keeping in mind centrality of religion and family in our society.
- Public awareness strategies need to highlight permissibility of such donations in light of religious teachings.
- The family needs to be given a formal role in the decision to donate.
Aamir Jafarey

Centre of Biomedical Ethics and Culture, SIUT, Pakistan

www.siut.org/bioethics
aamirjafarey@gmail.com