

ECT is an invasive procedure, like neurosurgery, and considerations of morbidity or mortality must therefore be viewed in this context. Untreated or treatment refractory mental illness kills and wastes precious lives. There is incontrovertible evidence that ECT is an effective treatment for depression (3), and substantial evidence that it is effective in mania (4) and schizophrenia (5), especially when other treatments fail. There is no credible evidence that ECT causes brain damage (6). ECT is not contraindicated, and may be especially effective, in pregnant women, children or the elderly (7).

Ours was not a prospective research study but a retrospective chart audit of clinical practice (2). Over 11 years, 6.3% of the 28,929 patients registered at our centre were treated with ECT, hardly the overenthusiastic and indiscriminate use implied by Waikar et al. (1). Of the 13,597 individual treatments given to 1,835 patients, the physical morbidity included spinal compression fractures and transient myalgia in less than 1%, resulting in short-lived pain but no disability, neurological deficits or long-term sequelae over up to 8 years follow-up. One patient died (mortality rate 0.05%) of a cardiac arrhythmia, though the subsequent 12 years and approximately 2,000 additional patients treated have not seen additional mortality.

In spite of this low complication rate for an invasive procedure, all treatment conducted here since 1995 have been modified under anaesthetic supervision, and our practice, frequently audited, conforms to the international technical and ethical standards. No patient has ever received ECT without personally (or a responsible relative) consenting. Fear of ECT is less with modified than with unmodified ECT but in both situations an unknown and reputedly hazardous procedure does generate apprehension, just as with tooth extraction or brain surgery. Pre-ECT sedation reduces apprehension. ECT, as practised in our centre, is hardly a lucrative enterprise since costs are low (Rs 180 per modified treatment, excluding anaesthetic drug costs) and many patients' treatments are free or heavily subsidised. Finally, our patients and their relatives have endorsed our use of ECT (8).

Unmodified ECT is aesthetically less appealing to patients and clinicians alike than modified ECT. Consideration of ways to phase out direct ECT such as changing from thrice a week to the equally effective twice a week regimen to reduce anaesthetist demand, or forming group practices with shared ECT and anaesthetic facilities, or deputing psychiatric personnel to get specialist anaesthetic training are inevitable, if ECT is to survive another 50 years. However, banning direct ECT overnight by legal action without ensuring the continued and effective delivery of ECT is tantamount to closing down mental hospitals without ensuring adequate community care.

Many clinicians, without access to anaesthetists, would face denying seriously mentally ill patients an effective treatment. Such a 'collateral damage' resulting from well-intentioned action is as unethical and unacceptable as some recent international events.

## References

1. Waikar A, Davar B, Karhadkar C, Bansode D, Dandekar D, Kakade S, Wayal S, Kulkarni Y. ECT without anaesthesia is unethical. *Issues in Medical Ethics* 2003;**11**:41–43.
2. Tharyan P, Saju PJ, Datta S, John JK, Kuruvilla K. Physical morbidity with unmodified ECT: a decade of experience. *Indian J Psychiatry* 1993;**35**:211–214.
3. The UK ECT Review Group. Efficacy and safety of electroconvulsive therapy in depressive disorders: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Lancet* 2003;**361**:799–808.
4. Mukherjee S, Sackeim HA, Schnur DB. Electroconvulsive therapy of acute manic episodes: review of 50 years' experience. *Am J Psychiatry* 1994;**151**:169–176.
5. Tharyan P, Adams CE. Electroconvulsive therapy for schizophrenia. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2002;(2):CD000076
6. Devanand DP, Dwork AJ, Hutchinson ER, Bolwig TG, Sackeim HA. Does ECT alter brain structure? *Am J Psychiatry* 1994;**151**:957–970.
7. American Psychiatric Association. The practice of electroconvulsive therapy: recommendations for treatment, training and privileging. *Task force report on ECT*. Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Association, 2001.
8. Prashanth NR. Attitudes of psychiatric patients and their relatives towards informed consent for electroconvulsive therapy. MD Dissertation. The Tamil Nadu Dr MGR Medical University, 1998.

Prathap Tharyan, Professor of Psychiatry, Christian Medical College, Vellore 632002, Tamil Nadu, India. e-mail: prathap@cmcvellore.ac.in

## Unmodified ECT vs modified ECT

This letter refers to the article by Chittaranjan Andrade regarding the use of unmodified ECT (1). The author has discussed the obvious advantages of modified ECT over unmodified ECT. He also highlights the ground realities and difficulties in practice of modified ECT. The author concludes that the use of unmodified ECT may be preferable to no ECT, as in the case when ECT is indicated but anaesthesiological facilities are unavailable or unaffordable.

Though I agree in principle with the points raised and this discussion may be scientifically correct, we need to know the views of the people who are going to be recipients of such treatment. It has been seen that doctors show remarkably little interest in their patients' views of the procedure and its effects on them (2). I think that in this discussion on the ethical issues of administering unmodified ECT, a patient's perspective is not being considered. Though no data are available, most of the patients who refuse ECT do so because of the fear associated with the procedure. This fear may be attributed to the gruesome and barbaric picture of ECT projected by the media in which patients are shown screaming and refusing ECT and later on convulsing.

The use of unmodified ECT would only increase this fear and lead to rejection and disrepute of this really effective modality of treatment for psychiatric disorders at the hands of the media and anti-ECT lobbies.

## References

1. Andrade C. Unmodified ECT: ethical issues. *Issues in Medical Ethics* 2003;**11**:9–10.
2. Abrams R. Patients attitudes, legal–regulatory issues, and informed consent. In: Abrams R (ed). *Electroconvulsive therapy*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Nischol K Raval, Lecturer in Psychiatry, Maharashtra Institute of Mental Health, Department of Psychiatry, Sassoon Hospital, Pune 411001, India. e-mail:nischolraval@hotmail.com

## Unmodified ECT: what is the patient's perspective?

Raval has correctly indicated that, when prescribing a treatment, it is necessary to be aware of the views of the recipients of the treatment. There is much literature on patients' experiences with and attitudes towards modified ECT in developed countries (1,2) as well as in India (3). There is, unhappily, no literature at all on patients' experiences with and attitudes towards unmodified ECT in any part of the world; in fact, it is uncertain whether, today, unmodified ECT is indeed practised in any other country!

Data on the subject should help form a more sound judgement about unmodified ECT. Unfortunately, such data are best obtained only through a study in which patients are randomised to receive either modified or unmodified ECT. If the data were to be obtained in any other way, adherents of unmodified ECT would claim that, in the absence of a control group, the experiences and attitudes documented merely reflect experiences with and attitudes towards ECT in general.

Raval additionally suggests that the practice of unmodified ECT may fuel the fears of patients who see ECT portrayed as a gruesome and barbaric treatment by the visual mass media. With apologies to Shakespeare, the fault, dear Brutus, lies not in unmodified ECT, but in its distorted portrayal. For example, an open heart surgery is well known to result in short- and long-term cognitive deficits; if the mass media were to use this knowledge to vilify open heart surgery, would it be justifiable to abandon the procedure? Sadly, in expressing his opinion, Raval is actually right. The strongest case for the abandonment of unmodified ECT is that its continued use may provide grist to the mill of publicity-hungry, self-important civil rights activists and sensationalistic film producers, and thereby jeopardise the survival of ECT itself.

## References

1. Freeman CPL, Kendell RE. ECT: Patients' experiences

and attitudes to ECT. *J Psychiatry* 1980;**137**:8–16.

2. Benbow SM. Patients' views on electroconvulsive therapy on completion of a course of treatment. *Convulsive Ther* 1988;**4**:146–152.
3. Andrade C, Mariadas B, Kalanidhi K, Reddy MV. Patients' knowledge about and attitudes towards ECT. Paper presented at the 45th Annual National Conference of the Indian Psychiatric Society, Lucknow, 1993.

Chittaranjan Andrade, Department of Psychopharmacology, National Institute of Mental Health and Neurosciences, Bangalore 560029, India. e-mail: andrade@vsnl.com

## 'Bust oil' and other bogus claims

Irrational, useless and even dangerous drugs flood the market. A certain company's rubs and iodide products for local application do business worth crores of rupees every year in India. Both multinational and Indian companies are involved in such practices. Since we do not raise objections, the manufacturers keep pushing new products to cheat consumers.

Initially, these tricks were restricted to what was sold as medicines. Recently, cosmetic products have been launched with advertisements that make false claims. Though vitamin E is not absorbed through the skin, soaps, creams, oils and lotions advertise vitamin E as an ingredient. Hair is just a dead extension of the hair follicle and its quality cannot be affected by external applications; even then products in the market promise to improve hair growth and retard greying.

With the entry of international brands in the Indian market, useless health drinks, herbal tea, nutritional supplements and breakfast cereals lure customers with the false promise of improving health. Buyers are lured by the nutritional and calorie content charts presented in stylish print and catchy formats. These products contain iron, calcium, minerals, trace elements or vitamins, but only in sub-therapeutic quantities. Such nutrients are present in larger quantities in the normal Indian diet.

Recently, the FDA in Mumbai raided a 'herbal' tea distributor. An analysis found the 'herbal tea' to be ordinary tea sold in fancy packaging for a high price. Because there are takers, there are sellers.

Recently, certain newspapers and magazines carried colourful advertisements for 'bust oil'. Among the claims made about the oil is that 'it keeps the breast toned up, it is needed by almost all age groups, it gives firmer, younger and tighter breasts,' and so on. Efforts must be made to counter such false and unethical advertisements.

Vijay Thawani, Associate Professor in Pharmacology, Government Medical College, Nagpur 440003, India. e-mail: thawani@nagpur.dot.net.in